

**Consultation document**

**Name of person / organization commenting:**

Kushtrim Bajrami, in the private capacity of national expert in the field of vocational education and training

**The main action areas of the organization:**

**Contact information of the organization (address, e-mail, phone number):**

Kushtrim Bajrami ([kushtrim.bajrami@gmail.com](mailto:kushtrim.bajrami@gmail.com))

**Date of comments delivery:**

15.05.2024

**Comments:**

Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosova

Prepared by the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation

Department of Vocational Education and Training;

**Commented [KB1]:** General Comment: The increase in autonomy and empowerment of the management of vocational schools has not been addressed at all, despite this issue being very important

**Commented [KB2]:** General Comment: All the objectives of this initiative are focused on reviewing the institutional and legal framework. Not included at all is one of the key priorities of the Government - dual education and its implementation modalities.

Content

Summary of the concept document..... 3

Introduction..... 5

Chapter 1: Definition of the problem ..... 5

**Description of the existing legal framework ..... 13**

Chapter 2: Objectives..... 22

Chapter 3: Options ..... 23

    Chapter 3.1: No legal changes, but only remedial interventions at the level of internal organizational documents of institutions in the field of education and professional training (No change option) ..... 24

    Chapter 3.2 Addressing the reform through the improvement of strategic documents in the field of vocational education and training, and of the NQF (Option for improving implementation and execution)..... 24

    Chapter 3.3: The third option the institutional structure of vocational education and training and the NQF in the Republic of Kosova through supplement-amendments of the individual laws (the third option)..... 25

Chapter 4: Identification and assessment of future impacts..... 27

    Chapter 4.1: Challenges with data collection..... 29

Chapter 5: Communication and Consultation ..... 29

Chapter 6: Comparing the options ..... 30

*Image 10. The comparison table with all three options ..... 31*

    Chapter 6.1: Implementation plans for the various options ..... 31

Chapter 7: Conclusions and future steps..... 38

    Chapter 7.1: Provisions for monitoring and evaluation ..... 38

Appendix 1: Economic impact evaluation form ..... 40

Appendix 2: Assessment form for social impact ..... 43

Appendix 3: Environmental impacts evaluation form ..... 46

Appendix 4: Fundamental rights impact evaluation form..... 48

Summary of the concept document

<b>Overall information</b>	
Title	Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosova
Lead ministry	Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation (MESTI).
Contact person	Lah Nitaj, Director, Department of Vocational Education and Training;
NDP	Strategic purpose 4.3.; Better harmonization of education with the needs of the labor market Measure 4.3.1. Improving the governance, financing and information management system of vocational education and training and adult education. Measure 4.3.2. Consolidation of mechanisms for quality assurance at the central level and at the IVET level. Measure 4.3.3 Harmonization of qualifications in vocational education and training, in accordance with the requirements of the labor market Measure 4.3.4. Providing opportunities for practical learning and operationalization of counseling and career guidance services
Strategic priority	National Development Strategy 2030, Objective 4.3.: Better harmonization of education with the needs of the labor market Measure 4.3.1. Improving the governance, financing and information management system of vocational education and training and adult education. Measure 4.3.2. Consolidation of mechanisms for quality assurance at the central level and at the IVET level. Measure 4.3.3 Harmonization of qualifications in vocational education and training, in accordance with the requirements of the labor market Measure 4.3.4. Providing opportunities for practical learning and operationalization of counseling and career guidance services Education Strategy 2022-2026: Strategic objective 3: Harmonization of vocational education and training with dynamic developments in technology and labor market, in terms of lifelong learning;

<b>Decision</b>	
Main issue	Consolidation and increasing the effectiveness of the institutional structure in the field of vocational education and training
Summary of consultations	//
Proposed option	<b>The third option (Addressing the reform of the institutional structure of vocational education and training and the NQF in the Republic of Kosova through supplement-amendments of the individual laws)</b>

<b>Main expected impacts</b>	
Budgetary impacts	The implementation of the policy is expected to have a budgetary impact; the fixed expenses for keeping two agencies in one will be reduced. Also, the administrative burden that has a relatively high fixed cost will be reduced.
Economic impacts	The implementation of the policy will have a positive impact on the country's economy. It will enable a better connection of vocational education and training with the needs of the labor market and the manufacturing and service industries in Kosovo. An increase in harmonization between the two will increase the efficiency of public money, increase the productivity of the local economy and its own education system in general. Also, the merging of the agencies will contribute to complementing the services of both previous institutions into a single one, a factor which will affect the development of the workforce.
Social impacts	The implementation of the policy is not expected to have any negative social impact. On the contrary, the concept document helps the policy of full employment, increasing the employability of social categories that have a lack of qualification, those who need retraining to keep the workplace or raising/promotion in the workplace, etc.
Impacts on fundamental rights	The implementation of the policy will not have any negative impact on fundamental rights. It, on the other hand, will help in the more effective fulfillment of the positive obligations of the state in relation to the right to education of individuals.
Environmental impacts	The implementation of the policy will not have any negative environmental impact.
Inter-sectoral impacts	The implementation of the policy will unify the educational policy with that of promoting and increasing competitiveness in the labor market, and the specialization of the manufacturing and service industries in the Kosovo market.
Administrative charges for companies	The implementation of the policy will not result in any new administrative burden, on the contrary, it aims to alleviate the excessive burdens that are produced due to bureaucratic procedures and the complexity of the institutional mechanism.
The SME test	The implementation of the policy will not result on having any negative impact on fundamental rights.

**Commented [KB3]:** How will this happen, which fixed expenses will be reduced? On the contrary, if indeed strengthening the Agency for VET with new mandates and functions is aimed for, then additional human, financial, institutional capacities will be required, and all of these require additional budget. This does not stand and does not make sense as long as the objective of this initiative is to empower the VET agency.

<b>Next steps</b>	
Short term	1. Drafting and adoption of the new law
Medium term	1. Reorganization of the Agency for Vocational Education and Training and the National Qualification Authority 2. Functionalization of the new structure of education and professional training and the start-implementation of new policies

## Introduction

Figure 1: Table with general information about the concept document

Title	Concept document for the field of governance and management of education and professional training in the Republic of Kosova
Lead ministry	Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation (MESTI); Department of Vocational Education
Contact person	Lah Nitaj, Director, Department of Vocational Education and Training;
NDP	4.3. Better harmonization of education with the needs of the labor market 4.3.1. Improving the governance, financing and information management system of vocational education and training and adult education.
Strategic priority	National Development Strategy 2030, Objective 5: Inclusive labor market, higher and decent employment Sub-objective 1; Skills development and expansion of employment services;
Working group	Members of the working group are: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Lah Nitaj, Director, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, chairperson;</li> <li>2. Valbona Fetiu-Mjeku, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, deputy chairperson</li> <li>3. Majlinda Rizvanolli, Cabinet of the Minister/MESTI, member</li> <li>4. Ryve Prekorogja, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>5. Veton Alihajdari, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>6. Rina Ponosheci, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>7. Agim Krasniqi, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>8. Afërdita Jaha, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>9. Fehmi Zylfiu, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>10. Isni Kryeziu, Department of Vocational Education/MESTI, member</li> <li>11. Fikrije Zymberi, Agency on Vocational Education and Training and Adult Education, member</li> <li>12. Arbër Salihu, National Qualifications Authority, member</li> <li>13. Besnike Mehmeti, Legal Office of OPM, member</li> <li>14. Mirlinda Lushaku, Government Coordinating Secretariat - OPM, member</li> <li>15. Mevlude Shamolli, Ministry of Finance, Labour and Transfers, member</li> <li>16. Representative from GIZ, member</li> <li>17. Anton Gojani, ALLED2 project, member</li> <li>18. Collegium of Municipality Education Directorates,</li> </ol>
Additional information	This concept document constitutes a beginning of the implementation of a comprehensive reform in the field of vocational education and training, which comes as a need of developments in the country's economy, namely the labor market, as well as the Report for the Republic of Kosova of the European Commission of the EU.

**Commented [KB4]:** Unfortunately, the private sector has not been involved/consulted at all in the preparation of this document. Similarly, the lack of involvement of representatives from vocational schools is also evident.

## Chapter 1: Definition of the problem

Public policy in the field of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosova constitutes one of the most important branches of the government plan, the National Development Strategy 2030, the Education Strategy 2022-2026, and the legislation in force in the field of pre-university education in general. Harmonization of educational programs in the field of vocational education and training with the requirements of the labor market, the development of competitive industries and generally following the

trends of globalization in terms of the knowledge and skills necessary to meet the needs of the employer constitute all important components of structural reforms in the Republic of Kosovo.<sup>1</sup>

A very important dimension in this framework of reforms is, first of all, the reform of the institutional structure in the field of vocational education and training. The lack of such a reform is making it impossible to clarify the lines of responsibility, simplify strategic planning, create a clear decision-making circuit for all issues related to the implementation of legislation, and also increase the accountability of institutional providers in this field. The current institutional structure is very complex, spread over many decision-making levels, fragmented in a non-proportional format in relation to a legitimate goal and, above all, distracted in some not very clear directions of responsibilities. Such institutional complexity also contributes to the lack of consolidation of internal mechanisms for quality assurance at the micro level (of IVETs): in the Education Strategy it is emphasized that the mechanisms for quality assurance at the system level, are not defined. As a result, there is a lack of systematic monitoring of the vocational education and training system and regular reporting on quality and development, which would inform and facilitate the design and planning of strategic policies. Therefore, it can be concluded that the lack of such an institutional framework that would enable simplification, consolidation and increasing the effectiveness of the institutional structure in the field of vocational education and training is preventing the implementation of a holistic reform in the field of vocational education and training. As it currently stands, there is a serious lack of accountability to central institutions, market participants/industries, end beneficiaries, the graduate community, etc. regarding the results of graduates in the labor market. This is also associated with a high administrative burden, which will be reduced through the provision of digitization where possible.

Vocational Education and Training does not properly equip and prepare students to enter the labor market after completing secondary vocational education, this is because VET faces many problems. The qualifications offered in vocational schools are not based on the needs of the labor market, the standards of the profession are missing for many profiles, the curriculum is not updated, while the decisions to open certain profiles are made without any real analysis of the needs of the labor market. Other problems related to secondary vocational schools are the lack of proper cooperation with businesses, insufficient adaptation to the labor market, insufficient infrastructure and equipment, lack of laboratories and workshops, practical learning and workplace learning, lack of materials teaching, as well as lack of career guidance and counseling services.

The current VET funding formula does not support the requirements and needs of VET since this formula is based on the allocation of the budget per student, while it does not take into account the needs of the profiles, such as the realization of professional practice, equipment, the raw material, trainings, accident insurance for students, transportation for practice, etc. This is a significant problem affecting performance and quality assurance in IVET.

Quality assurance in VET is a problematic in itself, although we have institutions responsible for implementing quality assurance, there are missing links and consolidation of mechanisms for policy implementation, related to inspection, monitoring and evaluation in the system of IVETs. So we do not have a systematic and comprehensive approach to quality assurance mechanisms which would directly affect the performance of IVETs. Quality management at the level of vocational schools and at the level of the system is not functional and efficient in quality monitoring, identification of intervention priorities for quality improvement and their implementation. The existing legal framework does not regulate the tracking of graduates of vocational education and training as an important measure for monitoring and quality

<sup>1</sup> A large number of unemployed, as shown in table no. 1, belong to the category of citizens who have no qualifications: an important spectrum to target in terms of vocational education and training policy.

**Commented [KB5]:** It is not clear what the problem is with the institutional structure of the VET. There should have been an elaboration of this issue as required by the title of this chapter. Furthermore, it should be clarified which lines of responsibility are unclear, why strategic planning is considered not simplified - what makes it complicated. What specifically is not working?

**Commented [KB6]:** Again, we are reaching a conclusion without elaborating on this initially. I believe this conclusion should be based on arguments.

**Commented [KB7]:** Then this should be referenced in a footnote.

**Commented [KB8]:** Why does this happen? Are there legal provisions that prevent the accountability? I think this is a matter of capacity and is not related to any legal distortion or deficiency.

**Commented [KB9]:** What specifically does this reflect as a high administrative burden?

**Commented [KB10]:** Agreed, these are the challenges and weaknesses of our VET system. However, how are these related to legislation? Do these problems present issues that could be resolved through interventions in legislation?

assurance. Consequently, there is also a lack of data on the employment of graduates and the compatibility of their skills with the demands of the labor market. Kosovo has not yet managed to develop a standardized methodology for researching the labor market and for predicting the needs of the labor market (Education Strategy 2022-2026), much less tracking the different career trajectories of initial and/or continuous VET graduates.<sup>2</sup>

The continuous professional development of teachers is another very important indicator that affects quality teaching, but addressing the needs for adequate and necessary training is a problem that IVET teachers are faced with. There is a lack of practical guidelines for identifying needs, planning and organizing professional development activities of school-based teachers, which are related to the implementation of the curriculum, the realization of practical learning, the design of teaching materials, the application of innovative teaching methods.

**Commented [KB11]:** The development of practical guides, programs for the teachers professional development, teaching materials, innovative teaching methods for teachers are neither hindered from being developed by current legislation nor are they developed through new legislation.

**Tabela 2: Papunësia e regjistruar sipas kualifikimeve**

Niveli i kualifikimeve	Papunësia	(%)	Ndryshimi te 2019	Femër	Meshkuj
Pa kualifikuar	83,317	49.3%	356.3%	38,880	44,437
Klasët I –IX (Shkolla fillore)	31,068	18.4%	80.7%	13,126	17,942
Arsim i mesëm profesional	31,987	18.9%	57.7%	11,353	20,634
Shkollë e mesme gjimnaz	10,579	6.3%	61.4%	4,709	5,870
Bachelor	11,069	6.6%	41.3%	7,075	3,994
Master	960	0.6%	42.6%	558	402
Doc. i Shkencave	-	-	-	-	-
Total	168,980	100%	138.7%	75,701	93,279

Source: Administrative employment data (MFLT, APRK, 2022)

**Commented [KB12]:** This is table 1 in the document - the number needs improvement. However, how is this table aligning with the content in the problem definition chapter?

Figure 2: Relevant policy documents, laws and sub-legal acts

Policy document, law or sub-legal act	Link to the politics or the planning document via the Internet or legal acts in the Official Gazette	State institution(s) responsible for implementation	Role and duties of the institution(s)
Law on Pre-university Education (No. 04/L-032)	<a href="https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDetail.aspx?ActID=2770">https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDetail.aspx?ActID=2770</a>	Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation	The Ministry holds the main responsibility for planning, setting standards and ensuring the quality of the pre-university education system, as well as having the general duties of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ developing policies, drafting and implementing legislation for the</li> </ul>

<sup>2</sup> Lack of clarity regarding the procedure for the implementation of various functions such as the assessment of needs and the planning of qualification programs offered by public institutions; planning the number of students who will be enrolled in different qualification profiles; starting the process for designing the curriculum/qualification programs offered by the IVETs; performance evaluation by the Education Inspectorate; and evaluation of the performance of the vocational education and training system.

			<p>development of pre-university education and training;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ to determine the results of different levels of pre-university education and training as well as to grant qualifications, or authorize their granting, to all those who successfully complete pre-university programs according to the relevant levels of the National Qualifications Framework;</li> <li>✓ to promote a non-discriminatory system of education in which the rights of each person for education and training are respected, as well as equal opportunities for quality education are offered;</li> <li>✓ to promote the protection of vulnerable groups within the education and training system; to ensure the health, safety and well-being of students and employees in the educational and training institution, as well as advance measures to prevent dropouts;</li> <li>✓ to establish criteria and manage a teacher licensing system, through the State Council for Teacher Licensing, established under this law;</li> <li>✓ to set and maintain an information system for the management of education and training.</li> <li>✓ to provide the commission for grants on an annual basis with sufficient data and formula standards in order to determine the specific grant for education in accordance with the law in force and the provisions of Article 28 of this law; to design and supervise effective forms of administration and management of educational and training institutions to be implemented by municipalities and to define criteria and procedures for</li> </ul>
--	--	--	--



			<p>monitoring the work of the Steering Council;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ to promote and improve the quality and efficiency of education and training through the 6 mechanisms mentioned in Article 8 of this law for inspection, monitoring, and evaluation in order to raise the quality and supervise the implementation of the legislation in force;</li> <li>✓ to determine the criteria for the assessment and grading of students in educational and training institutions;</li> <li>✓ to organize and manage external assessment for ISCED levels 1, 2 and 3 in accordance with the requirements for awarding qualifications of the National Qualifications Framework and, as necessary, in consultation with the National Qualifications Authority;</li> <li>✓ to ensure comprehensive policies for the integration of persons with special needs; 1.13. to promote the participation and partnership of parents and the community in educational and training activities through the Parents Council of Kosova, leading bodies of educational and training institutions and through other ways;</li> <li>✓ The Ministry names and renames public educational and training institutions based on the recommendation of the relevant Municipal Education Directorate (MED) based on the proposals made by the governing council of the educational or training institution, which can be up to three proposals.</li> </ul> <p>The competences of the Municipalities are regulated by the Law on Local Self-</p>
--	--	--	--

			<p>Government, no. 03/L040, dated February 20, 2008, and the Law on Education in Municipalities, no. 03/ L-068, May 21st, 2008.</p> <p><u>Municipalities have the following additional responsibilities:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ construction of educational and training facilities;</li> <li>✓ maintenance and repair of buildings and equipment of educational institutions;</li> <li>✓ ensuring a healthy environment, including drinking water, hygienic and sanitary conditions, health services, as well as a safe environment for students and staff, including providing safe services and effective security</li> <li>✓ through cooperation with parents, police and other public authorities, take steps to address violent behavior and abuse in or in relation to the relevant institution.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Law on Vocational Education and Training</b> (no. 04/ L-138)</p>	<p><a href="https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=8676">https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=8676</a></p>	<p>Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation</p> <p>&amp;</p> <p>Agency of Vocational Education and Training of Adults of Kosova,</p>	<p>Regulates the system of vocational education and training in accordance with the needs of the economic and social development of the Republic of Kosovo, including economic and technological changes, the demands of the labor market and the needs of individuals towards the market economy, optimally utilizing financial and human resources and infrastructure. The entire implementing authority has been entrusted to MESTI and the Agency for Vocational Education and Training of Adults.</p> <p><b>AVETA is responsible for:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ administration and leadership of Institutions of vocational and education and training of adults (IVETA), regarding the financial, human resources, construction facilities and</li> </ul>

			<p>infrastructure of all public VET institutions under its regulatory administration;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ under the supervision of AVETAE the relevant responsibilities of IVETAE will be gradually transferred to schools based on their capacities;</li> <li>✓ coordination of studies related to vocational education and training of adults;</li> <li>✓ coordination of international projects;</li> <li>✓ inclusion of social partners in vocational education and training of adults;</li> <li>✓ institutionalized participation of the private sector and social partners in vocational education and training of adults;</li> <li>✓ oversees and coordinates the development of professional standards. Also, the <b>Council for Vocational Education and Training of Adults (CVETA)</b> is an advisory body for MEST, and the operation of this council is determined by a sub-legal act issued by MESTI. CVETA offers advice and recommends the profiles for approval on which the vocational education and training programs should be based, the standards for each profile, the professional content of the curriculum for these profiles and the professional qualifications that should be included within the qualifications framework.</li> <li>✓ recommends textbooks and teaching materials for use in such programs;</li> <li>✓ CVETA may establish permanent professional commissions and temporary working groups to undertake specific activities, which may include teachers, representatives of social partners and other</li> </ul>
--	--	--	--

			<p>carrier organizations, professionals of the sector and others, as well as scientific experts in accordance with the regulations issued for the work of this council;</p> <p>CVETA adopts standards of the profession.</p>
<p><b>Law on Education and Training of Adults in the Republic of Kosova (No. 04/ L-143)</b></p>	<p><a href="https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=2868">https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=2868</a></p>	<p>Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation</p> <p>&amp;</p> <p>Agency of Vocational Education and Training and Adult Education</p>	<p>Regulates the entire process for the education and training of adults, as an integral part of the education system in Kosova. <b>Programs, qualifications and modules of education and training for adults are designed by MESTI, institutions and other relevant providers</b>, depending on their interests and activity with orientation in the labor market.</p> <p>Providers of formal education and training design their own programs and modules, which are accredited by NQA and approved by MESTI. The standards of the profession are developed in cooperation with MESTI, NQA, Ministry of Education and Culture, other relevant ministries and social partners.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>✓ Standards of the profession are approved by CVETA.</li> <li>✓ Verification of the professional standards is done by NQA</li> </ul>
<p><b>Law on National Qualification (No. 03/- 060)</b></p>	<p><a href="https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=2606">https://gzk.rks-gov.net/ActDocumentDetail.aspx?ActID=2606</a></p>	<p>Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation</p> <p>&amp;</p> <p>National Qualification Authority</p>	<p>Creates the National Qualifications System, which is based on the National Qualifications Framework (NQF), regulated by the National Qualifications Authority (NQA).</p>

## Description of the existing legal framework

The concept document for the reform of simplification, consolidation and increasing the effectiveness of the institutional structure in the field of vocational education and training has analyzed the field of VET in terms of the legal regulatory aspect, but also practical problems during the implementation of the legal framework. During the identification of the problem, the legal framework in force, the Education Strategy 2022-2026 and other research reports for the field of vocational education and training was analyzed.

### Laws related to Vocational Education and Training

**Law on Pre-university Education (No. 04/L-032)** regulates upbringing, education and pre-university training from ISCED levels 0 to 4 including the education and training of children and of adults obtaining qualifications at these levels. The law presents the principle that pre-university education is the joint responsibility of schools, municipalities and the central government. The law constitutes a general horizontal foundation for the entire field of pre-university education, without prejudice to vocational education and training.

**Law on Vocational Education and Training (no. 04/L-138)** as a basic law for the field of vocational education and training, it regulates the structure, organization and management of institutions that provide vocational education and training. This law also establishes the Agency for Vocational Education and Training of Adult Education (AVETA) and the Council for Vocational and Adult Education and Training (CVETA). The law regulates the national system of Vocational education and training which must ensure the compliance of education with the needs of the economic and social development of the Republic of Kosovo, including economic and technological changes, the demands of the labor market and the needs of individuals towards the market economy

**Law on Higher Education (No. 04/L-037)** which aims to create the legal basis for regulation, operation, financing, quality assurance in higher education in accordance with European standards as well as the role of the state and society in the development of higher education in the Republic of Kosova. The higher education system in Kosova operates through public universities and private institutions of higher education (colleges, institutes, higher vocational schools and academies)

Law on Kosova Accreditation Agency (No. 08/L-110) which regulates the status of the Kosova Accreditation Agency (KAA), as a regulatory agency in the processes and responsibilities of accreditation, re-accreditation, validation, monitoring for the purpose of ensuring quality in higher education in Kosova. KAA is the supervisor of quality assurance of programs and institutions of higher education that offer academic and professional programs, more specifically of institutions that offer programs from level 5-8 of the NQF.

**Law on Education in Municipalities of the Republic of Kosova (no. (03/L-068) (No. 04/L-143)** which defines the responsibilities of the municipalities for the management of the education system. The law provides municipalities with an important level to micro-manage public education within their territory, which also includes IVETs. In order to regulate the decentralization of educational competences, the law prescribes some specific responsibilities to municipalities, including school employment, school performance management, monitoring the quality of education provision as well as managing activities related to school infrastructure.

**Commented [KB13]:** I think the reform shouldn't have the emphasis on simplification and consolidation. It's enough for the goal to be increasing efficiency.

**Commented [KB14]:** Then, please present this analysis somewhere, because this analysis is missing in this concept document.

**Commented [KB15]:** Then it's good to reference them all.

**Law on Vocational Education and Training for Adults No. 04/L-143** which regulates the process for adult education as an integral part of the education system in Kosovo. According to this law, Education and Training Institutions for Adults are subject to monitoring and auditing by KAA.

**Law on National Qualification (No. 03/L- 060)** which regulates the development and maintenance of the National Qualifications Framework and the granting of qualifications for which it authorizes the National Qualifications Authority (with the exception of qualifications regulated under the provisions of the Law on Higher Education). The law also regulates the establishment of the National Qualifications Authority and its functions.

**Law on the Education Inspectorate in the Republic of Kosovo (No. 06/L-046)** which regulates the supervision of the implementation of the legislation in force in all institutions that provide educational and training services by the Education Inspectorate of the Republic of Kosovo.

**Law on Gender Equality (No. 05/L-020)** which guarantees, protects and promotes equality between the genders, as a fundamental value for the democratic development of society. The law defines the general and special measures for the protection and ensuring the equal rights of women and men, as well as defines the responsible institutions and their competences.

**Law on State Matura Exam (No. 05/1 -018)** which regulates the function, content, conditions, criteria and way of organizing the State Matura Exam. The law defines the duties of the State Matura Commission, the Division for Evaluation, Standards and Monitoring, the Municipal Education Directorates and higher secondary schools.

**Law on Training, Vocational Rehabilitation and Employment of Persons with Disabilities (Nr.03/L-019)** which regulates and defines the rights, conditions, ways of training, professional retraining and employment of persons with disabilities, for their integration in the open labor market according to the general and special conditions defined in the applicable legislation.

#### **The sub-legal acts that are authorized in the laws in the field of vocational education and training**

MESTI has approved a number of administrative instructions (AI) to regulate the aspects defined by the laws noted above. The main ones are as follows:

MESTI (2023) Administrative instruction no. 18/2023 for Career Advisors in HEI.

MESTI (2023). Administrative instruction No. 10/2023 on the Criteria and Procedures for the Establishment and Termination of the Pre-University Education Institutions Activity.

Regulation No.135/ 2020 for the protection and preservation of students' health during practical training at school and in the workplace (This is referred to as a regulation in the relevant document, but on the MESTI website it is listed as an administrative instruction

MEST (2020) Administrative instruction no. 137/2020 for Workplace Learning at IVET.

MEST (2020). Administrative Instruction no. 106/2020 for the Evaluation of the performance of the principal and vice-principal of the schools in public education and pre-university training institutions.

MEST (2019). Administrative Instruction No. 15/2019 on Duties, responsibilities, procedures and criteria for the appointment of the principal and vice-principal of the public education and pre-university training institutions.

MEST (2017). Regulation no. 01/2017 for the Planning and expenditure of the incomes realized by the Institutions of Vocational Education and Training for Adults.

MEST (2017). Administrative Instruction no. 04/2017 on Performance Evaluation in educational institutions.

MEST (2016). Administrative Instruction no. 24/2016 on Quality Assurance in Pre-University Education.

MEST (2016). Administrative Instruction no. 23/2016 for the school development plan and the municipal education development plan.

MEST (2016). Administrative Instruction no. 17/2016 on the licensing conditions and criteria of private pre-university vocational educational and training institutions.

Administrative Instruction no. 04/2015 on the Establishment, operation and composition of the Council for Vocational Education and Training and Adult Education.

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 14/2014 on the Agency for Vocational and Training Education and Adult Education (AVETAE) in Kosova

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 35/2014 on the criteria and procedures for the validation and approval of the qualification and national accreditation of the institutions that offer qualifications in Kosova.

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 32/2014 on Criteria and procedures for quality assurance in vocational educational and training institutions.

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction No. 7/2014 for the advancement, autonomy and functioning of VET institutions.

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 32/2014 on Criteria and procedures for quality assurance in vocational educational and training-internal processes

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 04/2014 for the conditions and criteria of the economic activity of VET institutions;

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 01/2014 for Organization and planning of the educational process in VET.

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 28/2014 on the criteria and procedures for the verification of SPs [56];

MEST (2014). Administrative Instruction no. 31/2014 on recognition of prior learning [48];

MEST (2013). Administrative Instruction no. 34/2013 on the Composition, function, duties, mandate of the Steering Council's representation in VET institutions.

MEST (2013). Administrative Instruction no. 33/2013 on the Implementation of the municipal formula for determining the allocation of the school budget for schools administered by municipalities.

KAA (2011). Guidelines for the further development of the quality system for external evaluation of VET in Kosovo.

MES (2009). Administrative Instruction no. 17/2009 on the Procedure for selecting educational personnel in schools.

### **Legislative context related to the acquis**

The harmonization of laws in the field of vocational education and training is also an obligation of the Republic of Kosovo that originates from the Stabilization and Association Agreement. The EU has developed several recommendations in the field of vocational education and training to which this concept document will also refer.

The Stabilization and Association Agreement in Article 107 for the field of education and training states that the parties will cooperate with the aim of raising the level of general education and vocational education and training, as well as youth policies and youth work in Kosovo, as means to promote skills development, employability, social inclusion and economic development in Kosovo. The Parties shall also cooperate with the aim of ensuring that access to all levels of education and training in Kosovo is free from discrimination on the basis of gender, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation. The collaboration will aim to address the needs of students with disabilities in Kosovo.

On November 24th 2020, the EU Council adopted a Recommendation on vocational education and training for sustainable competitiveness, social justice and flexibility. As underlined in the recommendation, vocational education and training have a key role in sustainable competition, social justice and sustainability for preparing young people to successfully enter working life and for the training and retraining needs of the working-age population, to empowering everyone with the knowledge, skills and attitudes to thrive in their professional, social and personal development. The recommendation sets out key principles to ensure that vocational education and training quickly adapts to the needs of the labor market and provides quality learning opportunities for young people and adults. The recommendation places a strong focus on increasing the flexibility of vocational education and training, increased opportunities for work-based learning, internships and improving quality assurance, all of which will be addressed first by the reform of the simplification of the institutional structure. responsible for vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo. The recommendations that emerge from an analysis of the compatibility of the reform with the acquis are:

- providing a level of autonomy to IVETs to allow them to react quickly to skills challenges, offer rapid retraining programs and work in close partnerships with public and private sector employers;
- modularization of vocational education and training programs and their expansion to higher levels of qualifications;
- increasing the digital readiness of VET institutions;



- determining indicators to enable quantitative and qualitative monitoring of the performance of vocational education and training systems.
- The principles, criteria and indicators of quality in NCQA should be simplified, based on results and better harmonized with EQAVET.

These recommendations are also in line with the Osnabrück Declaration of 30 November 2020 signed by the ministers responsible for vocational education and training from EU member states, candidate countries, EEA-EFTA countries (European Economic Area - European Free Trade Association), the European social partners and the European Commission for Vocational Education and Training as an Recovery Enabler and of Fair Transition toward Digital and Green Economies. These are in line with the Erasmus Program for 2021-2027, managed by the European Commission, the European Education and Culture Executive Agency and the Erasmus+ national agencies, whose aim is to improve the quality of VET across the EU.

### Experiences from other countries

In order to draft this concept document, practices from countries such as Estonia, Croatia, Slovenia and Albania were analyzed. The reason why these countries were selected is because they have had similar transition paths and are relatively small countries with similar levels of challenges.

With reference to Kosovo's VET, the main pillars that have been taken into account to analyze the experiences in these countries are: the function of the relevant VET agencies, in the active participation of employers in professional training, as well as the organization of National Qualifications Frameworks (NQFs), and finally the legislation they have as a basis to regulate and monitor VET.

*The following aspects can provide impulses for the VET agency:*

- In 2009, Estonia established the Agency EKKA (Estonian Quality Agency for Higher and Vocational Education) now called HAKA (Estonian Quality Agency for Education) which is the main competence center in the field of education in Estonia. HAKA's mission is to empower educational institutions and other stakeholders in advancing the quality of learning and teaching, as well as supporting student development. At the national level, the economic chamber, the confederation of employers and the confederation of trade unions represent the social partners. Employers play an active and influential role in professional advices and the development of standards for each profession. At the local level, the social partners participate in the advisory boards of VET schools.
- The Croatian VET system benefits from a strong VET agency, ASOO. So there is a central institution that shapes VET in the country. According to the Croatian VET system, an agency can work more closely with stakeholders, especially employers, than a ministry can.
- Slovenia has also created an agency - the Institute of the Republic of Slovenia for Vocational Education and Training (CPI) which has the task of preparing proposals for solutions and systemic measures, as well as supporting various education providers and other interest groups in the field of professional education. The institute also conducts research, monitors and evaluates sectors or special elements of vocational education. In cooperation with social partners, the Institute develops professional solutions and directs the development of vocational education. It designs vocational educational and training programs, coordinates their preparation and ensures their application and implementation. The Institute provides professional support for management staff

**Commented [KB16]:** This part seems quite poor. I think the key elements of some countries in the region and EU countries regarding the governance and management of AAP should be presented, especially the key elements of VET legislation. All of this part consists of descriptions that don't seem to relate to the objectives of this concept document and doesn't present practices that could be considered in the VET system in Kosovo.

and specialists of vocational schools and other interest groups, advising them on the planning and implementation of educational measures and the application of professional solutions.

Albania has also established AKAFPK (National Agency for Vocational Education, Training and Qualifications) which is the public institution responsible for improving vocational education and training, but which has many responsibilities, facing essential challenges that, among other things, have to do with the financing of the institution and the qualification of employees. This is a subordinate institution of the Ministry of Finance and Economy.

*The following aspects can provide impulses for the involvement of the private sector:*

In recent years, Croatia and Slovenia have applied dual vocational training approaches. The challenges are similar and are about finding sustainable support of sufficient companies that are actively engaged through in-company training. The VET systems of these countries provide various support measures for companies to encourage their participation in vocational education. This may include financial incentives, tax benefits or other forms of support.

- In 2018, the Ministry of Science and Education in Croatia launched an experimental program of dual education and training. This program involves many stakeholders, including ministries, agencies, councils, employers' associations and partner institutions from Germany, Austria and Switzerland. The program focuses on work-based learning, professional development of teachers and mentors, technology sharing, progress monitoring and final exams. VET schools are responsible for teaching, planning work-based learning activities and supporting mentors. Work-based learning is first organized in VET schools and later moves to business entities. Entities are required to provide training for mentors, enable quality assurance and provide monthly stipends to learners during work-based learning periods. In Croatia, companies offering internships to students in 3-year VET programs are entitled to benefit from tax facilitations, reducing their taxable income. Entrepreneurs who train one to three students per year on their premises can reduce their taxable income by 5%; an additional student further reduces taxable income by 1 percentage point, up to a limit of 15%.

In Slovenia, in addition to the implementation of forms similar to those in Kosova (school-based professional practice, company practice, MVP) there is a contract-based model, where trainees sign an agreement with a company responsible for their practical training. The school is responsible for the theoretical part of the training.

In Albania, the VET law also provides that the private sector is involved in the evaluation and certification of qualifications. This means that businesses can use their expertise and experience to assess and confirm the quality of acquired skills and competencies. Recently, new partnerships have been seen between VET providers, such as vocational schools and other educational institutions, and businesses, to ensure that training meets the demands of the labor market.

*Regarding the National Qualifications Framework (NQF), in all the experiences analyzed, these are some of the similarities and differences that are related to the role of the NQF in Kosova:*

- The eight-level Estonian Qualifications Framework (EstQF) was established in 2008, by the Law on Professional Qualifications. EstQF has 8 levels, the qualification level descriptions are identical to the KEK level descriptions. VET qualifications are spread across EstQF levels 2-5. EstQF is a comprehensive framework, consisting of four sub-frameworks for:
  - general education qualifications;

- VET qualifications;
  - Higher education qualifications;
  - Professional qualifications.
- In Croatia, the Croatian Qualifications Framework (CROQF) was established under the Croatian Law on Qualifications in 2013 (amended in 2018) under the jurisdiction of the Croatian Ministry of Science, Education and Sports (2013; Croatian Ministry of Science and Education, 2018) . The National Council for the Development of Human Potential was appointed as the strategic body responsible for the development and implementation of CROQF. It includes eight levels and three sub-levels (at levels 4, 7 and 8), categorized based on learning outcomes: knowledge, skills and level of autonomy and responsibility. This sub-leveling of qualifications in the framework comes as a result of the rather diversified offer of VET in Croatia which creates opportunities for penetration into several further pathways from the initial VET.
  - In Slovenia, the SQF law, which has been in force since January 2016, provides practical guidance for the implementation of the framework. It describes the responsibilities of the ministries and stakeholders involved in the design and provision of qualifications, defines the tasks of the National Coordination Point (CPI) with KEK and the expert committee of NCP SQF-KEK. In Slovenia, a communication strategy has been created to increase the visibility and use of the framework among different user groups, including the labor market. As a result, recognition and application of the framework has increased, even in the context of the labor market.
  - In Albania, the governance and supervision of the Albanian National Framework includes several key institutions, namely the Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth, the Ministry of Finance and Economy and the National Agency for Vocational Education, Training and Qualifications. These institutions collectively take responsibility for the effective implementation and maintenance of the NAF. So, in Albania, a special official body for the supervision of NAF has not been established. However, recognizing the challenges and complexity during the implementation of the NAF, both the Ministry of Education, Sports and Youth and the Ministry of Finance and Economy have created a task force. This collaborative initiative, mandated for a period of two years according to a joint Ministerial Order, aims to address the identified difficulties and ensure the smooth running of the NAF implementation process in cooperation with the NAVETQ.

*As for the legislative framework, these states have many points in common and similar to those of Kosovo. But to be distinguished are these states with the following features:*

- On December 12, 2018, the Estonian Parliament approved changes to the law on vocational education institutions to better connect vocational programs with the labor market and renew the principles of funding vocational schools. According to the legislation, the parliament, the government and the ministry of education jointly oversee the VET system at the national level. The Ministry of Education approves the national VET curricula. Whereas, since 2012, the Innove foundation has implemented the national education policy, as defined by the Ministry of Education. The foundation organizes the development of national curricula, supports implementation and organizes the training of VET teachers. Several advisory bodies and social partner organizations participate in policy implementation. The local government prepares and implements the development plans of local education, as well as coordinates activities of municipal educational institutions. The participation of social partners in VET is regulated by national legislation and partnership agreements.

- The special law of Slovenia and Croatia that regulates and monitors VET in higher education. This fact can highlight the importance that these two countries attach to the level of VET in expanding and diversifying the offer for initial and continuous VET graduates as a way to raise penetration. Through these laws, the role of monitoring and ensuring the quality of this offer is regulated and defined, which is clearly different from the academic one. Both states offer programs at various levels of continuing VET as well as at the higher education level.
- In Albania, the centralized governance of VET dominates and the main bearer of policy making is the Ministry of Finance and Economy, which includes both forms of VET: initial and continuous (formal and informal - that is, including that provided through measures employment assets).

### The problem tree

The governance of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo constitutes an institutional framework that is very complex, extended to many decision-making levels, fragmented in a non-proportional format in relation to a legitimate goal and, above all, distracted in several directions very clear responsibilities. This form of organization has produced a serious lack of policy consolidation, governance and quality control of vocational education and training institutions. The lack of a consolidated government, without a unitary form of legislation and in the absence of a clear quality control chain has produced an unstable situation of governance, quality, productivity and disconnection from the demands of the labor market.

Figure 3: Problem tree, showing the main problem, its causes and effects

<b>Effects:</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Lack of quality in the teaching results</li> <li>2. Lack of involvement of industry stakeholders directly in the planning and implementation of VET policies</li> <li>3. Disconnection of vocational education and training programs with the demands of today's labor market</li> <li>4. Insufficient coordination between governance levels in terms of priorities, their implementation and practical governance of VET schools/institutions</li> <li>5. Lack of accountability based on performance/productivity (output) and lack of proper planning of resources and their distribution (input)</li> <li>6. Lack of a quality control system and its use in the further development of the teacher qualifications system</li> <li>7. Increased administrative burden in the governance of vocational education and training.</li> </ol>
<b>Main problem</b>	<b>Insufficient harmonization and consolidation of the governing VET institutions</b>
<b>Causes</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Large number of institutions involved, without a clear division of competences and responsibilities.</li> <li>2. Duplication of responsibilities in the VET field.</li> <li>3. Lack of administrative functions and professional capacities.</li> <li>4. Lack of coherent control, mentoring and performance monitoring mechanisms, based on results.</li> <li>5. A set of unharmonized legislative acts, and spread over many instruments.</li> </ol>

The figure below lists the identified stakeholders. It also shows whether they are affected by causes,

**Commented [KB17]:** Nowhere has been elaborated through the presentation of arguments how we arrive at this conclusion. I don't believe this conclusion holds. Kosovo is not different from other countries in the institutional framework. I don't think these are institutional framework problems. The problems are more related to capacities.

**Commented [KB18]:** It's quite strange that in an official document of the Ministry, all the work of the Ministry itself is described in such a critical manner.

**Commented [KB19]:** What specifically has not been consolidated in governance? What is meant by a unified format of legislation? Even according to this concept, Kosovo will have several laws related to VET and one basic law for VET. This is the current situation as well. Isn't the NQA an institution that makes efforts for quality assurance? I have the impression that even in independent international reports, the situation is presented slightly better than in this document regarding governance and quality assurance in VET.

**Commented [KB20]:** The effects are not being directly correlated with the following causes, nor with the above effects.

**Commented [KB21]:** Indeed, there are only 3 institutions involved: the Ministry of Education, Science, Technology, and Innovation (MESTI), the Agency for VET, and the NQA. It doesn't seem to be a very large number. However, which competencies and responsibilities are not clearly defined and which responsibilities are duplicated? It would be good to be more specific because this way we don't contribute to the drafting process of the new VET law.

**Commented [KB22]:** As mentioned earlier, specifically which key administrative functions are missing?

**Commented [KB23]:** It seems that the issue concerns Administrative Instructions. It should be elaborated and argued somewhere what and how these legislative acts are not harmonized.

effects or both. In addition, the last column in the summary shows how they are affected. Chapter 5 provides information on how these stakeholders were consulted.

Figure 4: Overview of stakeholders based on problem definition:

Name of the stakeholder	Cause/s to which the party is connected	Effect/s to which the party is connected	The way in which the party is related to this cause(s) or effect(s)
Ministry of Education, Science, Technology and Innovation	<p>Unnatural and increased administrative burden in the governance of vocational education and training; lack of digitized processes.</p> <p>Duplication of responsibilities in the VET field;</p> <p>Large number of institutions involved without a clear division of responsibilities and duties.</p> <p>A set of unharmonized legislative acts, and spread over many instruments;</p>	<p>Lack of quality in the teaching results;</p> <p>Insufficient coordination between governance levels in terms of priorities, their implementation and practical governance of VET schools/institutions;</p> <p>Lack of accountability based on performance/productivity (output) and lack of proper planning of resources and their distribution (input);</p>	The policy-making responsibility of the Ministry is to ensure an easy and rational system of governance of vocational education and training
Agency for Vocational Education and Training and Adult Education	<p>Lack of a coherent results-based performance control chain;</p> <p>A set of unharmonized legislative acts, and spread over many instruments;</p>	<p>Disconnection of vocational education and training programs with the demands of today's labor market;</p> <p>Lack of a quality control system and its use in the further development of the teacher qualifications system;</p>	Administrative responsibility of the agency
National Qualification Authority	Lack of a coherent results-based performance control chain	Disconnection of vocational education and training programs with chain	Administrative responsibility of the agency

**Commented [KB24]:** Has the private sector been consulted?

**Commented [KB25]:** The private sector is not represented at all as a party of interest and is not included at all in the table below.

		the demands of today's labor market;  Lack of a quality control system and its use in the further development of the teacher qualifications system;	
Council for Vocational Education and Training and for Adults	Lack of a coherent results-based performance control chain	Disconnection of vocational education and training programs with the demands of today's labor market	Advisory responsibility of the council

## Chapter 2: Objectives

This concept document aims to achieve a number of objectives related to the goals of the Government of the Republic of Kosovo for the connection of vocational education and training with the labor market, and the adaptation of educational and training programs to the growing demands of industries in competitive markets in Europe and beyond.

Figure 5: Relevant government objectives

Relevant objective	Name of the relevant planning document (source)
Harmonization of vocational education and training to the labor market demands	Program of the Government of the Republic of Kosovo 2021-2025
Economic Recovery - the creation of new jobs and economic development	Program of the Government of the Republic of Kosovo 2021-2025
Inclusive labor market, higher and decent employment	National Development Strategy 2030
Skills development and expansion of employment services;	National Development Strategy 2030
Harmonization of vocational education and training with dynamic developments in technology and labor market, in terms of lifelong learning;	Education Strategy 2022– 2026

The objectives of this concept document serves the implementation of the following strategic documents:

1. the National Development Strategy 2030, namely the objective of better harmonization of education with the needs of the labor market;

2. The Program of the Government of the Republic of Kosova 2021-2025, namely the objective of harmonizing vocational education and training with the labor market demands;
3. Program for Economic Reforms 2022-2024 EU-Kosova, namely reform measure 1: 'The adaptation of vocational education and training to the labor market demands';
4. The National Program for the Implementation of the Stabilization-Association Agreement (PKZMSA) 2022-2026, the part of the acquis in the field of education, and
5. Education Strategy 2022-2026, in the objectives related to governance and quality assurance in vocational education and training and in addressing challenges at the school level.

The specific objectives of this concept document are as follows (described in specific sub-sections):

**Objective 1: Restructuring of central institutions in the field of vocational education and training**

**Objective 2: Empowering the agency with a full circle of competencies in the executive, administrative, regulatory field, in the field of vocational education and training of the NQF**

**Objective 3: Harmonization of laws in the field of vocational education and training in one legal act**

**Objective 4: Creation of independent mechanisms with responsibility for accreditation of IVETs within the agency.**

**Objective 5: The provision of a mechanism that links vocational education and training programs with the market needs.**

**Objective 6: Creation of an accountable circuit in the governance of vocational education and training**

### Chapter 3: Options

The reform in VET in the context of simplifying, consolidating and increasing the effectiveness of the institutional structure in the field of vocational education and training should have the following goals (which are broken down in the following section into specific objectives):

1. Harmonization of laws in the field of vocational education and training in one single legal act;
2. Unification of all structures of the 'executive agency' form or similar bodies established by laws or sub-legal acts in the field of vocational education and training, in a single body, preferably in the form of a new executive agency under the Ministry of Education;
3. Empowering the new body with the necessary range of competencies in executive/administrative, supporting, assisting, financing functions for IVETs and IVETA, and policy-making in all components except public policies in the form of law (which remain the responsibility of DVETs);
4. Establishing the necessary guarantees of independence for the decision-making components within the new body, which are responsible for the accreditation of IVETs and IVETA in terms of the NQF;
5. The coordination of the decision-making of the new body, in the issues that are key for the final effect of the graduates in the labor market and the sector of specialized industries, in such a way that the decision-making is of a corporate format (with industries or their coalitions/groups as the central stakeholder in decision-making);

**Commented [KB26]:** Objective 1 and 2 could be combined into one objective: "Restructuring the central institutions of vocational education and training through strengthening the VET Agency with a complete circle of competencies in the executive, administrative, regulatory fields in the field of education and vocational training, and NQF."

**Commented [KB27]:** I don't think that stands. This concept document is not claiming that there will be only one law for the entire field of VET. Of course, there will remain laws for national qualifications, laws for pre-university education, laws for education in municipalities, laws for adult education, which will continue to cover segments of the VET field.

**Commented [KB28]:** All other objectives 1, 2, 4, 5, 6 are related to the VET agency or the functions that the new agency will have, but objective 3 goes beyond these. It is clear that establishing the new VET agency with strengthened functions and mandates requires that this be reflected in legislative changes, but this should be the final step, after all arguments and consultations regarding the new functions of the agency and its organizational structure have been exhausted. Furthermore, this objective excludes options 1 and 2, because in options 1 and 2, legislative changes are not addressed. In fact, this makes them fictitious options because if harmonizing laws in the field of VET is the goal, then options 1 and 2 cannot be options at all because they do not reflect the goal.

**Commented [KB29]:** The current VET agency manages centers of competences. This is also the Croatian model of the VET agency. However, in this case, an agency that manages CoCs cannot also be responsible for accreditation, namely external quality assurance. If the VET agency ... [1]

**Commented [KB30]:** It is not clear what mechanism is being referred to that links vocational education and training programs with market needs; however, I think the wording should be more concise.

**Commented [KB31]:** The three options should be elaborated, compared based on common criteria that are based on the defined objectives of the concept document. This is not the case with these options.

**Commented [KB32]:** I don't think that holds. This concept document is not claiming that there will be only one law for the entire field of VET. Of course, laws for national qualifications, laws for pre-university education, laws for ... [2]

**Commented [KB33]:** From this, is it understood that administrative instructions will also be issued by the new Agency? Is this in line with the mandate of independent agencies as defined by the respective law for agencies?

**Commented [KB34]:** The current agency for VET includes the management of Centers of Competence (CoCs). However, in this case, an agency managing CoCs cannot also be responsible for accreditation, namely external quality assurance. If the VET agency decides to engage in ... [3]

6. Creating a clear line of accountability for the new troupe, and the creation of a legal mechanism that foresees transparency and performance based on results in front of three audiences: a) The Ministry of Education, as the institution to which the troupe will have institutional subordination, IVETs/IVETA, whom the new body will serve but also manage in terms of central level competences, and, 3) stakeholders in the labor market, to whom the new body must prove the delivery of results in the perspective of the final beneficiary.

In relation to these goals, the concept document addresses three options. The first option is the option without any change or keeping the status-quo. The second option is to improve the situation with changes in separate legal acts, and the third option is to adopt a new codifying law for the field of vocational education and training. The options presented should enable the fastest achievement of the goals set out in chapter 1 of this concept document ('definition of the problem').

**Chapter 3.1: No legal changes, but only remedial interventions at the level of internal organizational documents of institutions in the field of education and professional training (No change option)**

According to this option, no change is recommended in the basic legal framework of vocational education and training, nor in the sub-legal acts. With the application of the no-change option, the difficulties presented above will continue to remain. Interventions at the level of internal organizational documents, namely internal acts of organization and systematization of workplaces, are insufficient and do not guarantee a change in the institutional structure of the field of vocational education and training in the sense intended in Chapter 1 and Chapter 2 ('objectives'). Also, the intervention at the level of internal organizational documents does not allow changing the procedures and determinations in the legal basis that have been approved in different periods of time and as such do not follow a harmonized/unified approach. According to this option, the situation associated with the lack of a clear and harmonized institutional and legal framework would continue to exist, the bottom beneficiary would continue to suffer the consequences of this problem, while the labor market would continue to be unharmonized with vocational education and training programs. This situation would aggravate even more the weak situation of the skills present in the labor market, as a result of which the service and production economy would bear the consequences of a very high cost, uncompetitive situation in the regional market and the loss of the workforce that requires professional qualification in foreign educational systems. Consequently, it is not suggested to follow this option because technical-technological changes, market/industry needs, new skills needs, new VET learning modalities in the field of qualifications and re-qualifications are not covered by the current situation and there is an administrative burden.

**Chapter 3.2 Addressing the reform through the improvement of strategic documents in the field of vocational education and training, and of the NQF (Option for improving implementation and execution)**

This option includes the adaptation of the base of strategic documents in the direction of increasing the coordination and efficiency of cooperation of governing institutions in the field of VET. Based on this option, MESTI would have to review the relevant education strategy and foresee a change in the forms of cooperation between the three governing bodies of VET, to envisage a plan of coordinating activities between them and to envisage eventually a new cooperation strategy based on concrete projects and plans for the three. This option would increase policy planning in relation to the coordination and cooperation of VET institutions, and would also define in a written form their joint activities, sharing operational responsibilities according to their mandates and the sharing tasks to achieve common goals. Intervention at

**Commented [KB35]:** Institutions like VET Agency and NQA don't have internal organizational documents; almost everything is determined by sub-legal acts issued by the Ministry.

**Commented [KB36]:** I don't think this option is being presented adequately. Perhaps the option should involve intervention through sub-legal acts, regardless of changes to the law. As presented in this document, it's not an option at all.

**Commented [KB37]:** What is not covered in the current legislation specifically? Technological advancements, labor market dynamics, and skills will change over time, so it's important that the law provides a regulatory platform that enables developmental dynamics. What aspects of these dynamics are hindered by the current legislation?



the level of strategic documents, however, would have a low impact on the expected results. The VET institutions, however, would remain as separate bodies, with completely unharmonized legal bases and a mandate distributed in incoherent directions. Moreover, the intervention at the strategic level would not produce any change in relation to the objective of linking the VET with the labor market, a dimension that requires the establishment of the mechanism provided by the VET law in force. On the other hand, the extraordinary institutional and administrative complexity would continue to have the same form and content, without positively affecting the status of the final beneficiary, the student. Therefore, pursuing this option is not recommended due to its inability to achieve the results envisaged in the 'objectives' section.

### Chapter 3.3: The third option the institutional structure of vocational education and training and the NQF in the Republic of Kosova through supplement-amendments of the individual laws (the third option)

**This option includes updating the entire current legal framework first through the drafting and approval of a basic law for the field of VET, and then, in a second two-year period, the supplement-amendments of two other related laws, that of the NQF and VET for Adults (lifelong education). On such a basis, sub-legal acts will be updated in accordance with the provisions of this reform.** By addressing the supplement-amendments of the three current laws, in addition to advancing the reform of rationalization and institutional strengthening of VET, the objective of harmonizing the subject matter of vocational education/training and that of the NQF with international and European standards will also be achieved in the field of qualifications.

This option, i.e. the third option, foresees individualized supplement-amendments to the laws in the field of vocational education and training, initially the supplement-amendments to the Law on Vocational Education and Training in the Republic of Kosova during 2024. Then, after the foundation of the VET reform has been well established in the basic law, during the years 2025 and 2026, the Law on Vocational Education and Training for Adults and the Law on the NQF will be supplemented-amended. The distributed legal basis, in at least three laws, the Law on Vocational Education and Training in the Republic of Kosova and the Law on Education and Training for Adults and the Law on National Qualifications has created a complicated and non-uniform format of legal regulation for the field of vocational education and training. This legal fragmentation, which has been a reflection of separate and difficult interconnected law-making processes, has made the implementation of laws in the field of vocational education and training very difficult, diffuse and uncoordinated. This implies that Objective 1 and Objective 2 should be accompanied by Objective 3, that of harmonizing the matter of the three laws, as it should have been naturally from the beginning. The merger of the three institutional mechanisms into a single executive agency makes the harmonization of the matter of the three laws even more necessary, namely the new Law on vocational education and training, the one on adults and on qualifications framework. The harmonization would serve the purpose of simplification through the uniformity of the legal basis, and where the shortcomings in the connection of the NQF with the general policy-making sector of vocational education and training would be eliminated, but on the other hand, connections would be created with the industry based on the same legal circuit, and not in parallel form as it is currently. Through these changes, a number of clauses would be foreseen that would address their harmonization, namely their uniformity, in the direction of a unified policy regarding the governance of VET. The new law will establish the relevant agency for education and vocational training, which merges the two previous agencies, and will define in its transitional provisions the transition of civil servants, the internal organization and the legacy of institutional (and decision-making) memory for the two predecessor agencies. The new law will guarantee compliance with the Law on the Organization and Functioning of the State Administration and Independent Agencies of the Republic of Kosova, and will also provide for the mechanisms described in Chapter 2 (the objectives). The new law

**Commented [KB38]:** Why would it have a low impact? Or, alternatively, why is legislative intervention thought to have a greater impact?

**Commented [KB39]:** I don't think this observation stands, and in my opinion, it's entirely unfounded. Everywhere in the region and beyond, 2-3 separate institutions are responsible for certain segments of VET. They are divided for a reason, and they should remain so. Their legal basis is the Law on VET and the Law on National Qualifications - laws that are separated in most systems.

**Commented [KB40]:** These are observations, nowhere are the arguments provided. I don't believe that our VET system is characterized by "extraordinary institutional and administrative complexity."

**Commented [KB41]:** Now here it is confirmed that what is stated in objective 1, harmonization of legislative acts into a single law, is not valid. Therefore, we will have separate laws regulating the field of VET.

**Commented [KB42]:** I think that adult education should also be part of the Law on VET, and there is no need for a separate law.

**Commented [KB43]:** Now, this is confusing, how will this "scattered legal basis" be summarized?

**Commented [KB44]:** A statement that I don't think holds. What specifically in the current laws has made the implementation of laws in VET difficult, diffuse, and uncoordinated? Arguments supporting such strong statements need to be provided.

**Commented [KB45]:** In a single law? Now please clarify, will there be one law for VET, adult education, and qualifications, or three separate laws?

**Commented [KB46]:** Unclear, how are the current links with industry structured in parallel?

would provide for a well-equipped executive agency with full administrative and regulatory executive competences, and an initial mandate to empower, support and monitor the quality of VET institutions and their programs. The current institutional structure in the field of vocational education and training will be simplified and unified in a single body. In order to fulfill this objective, it is necessary to merge AVETA and KAA into a single body. Such a merger is in line with the expectations of the European Union in terms of Public Administration Reform based on which MESTI has the obligation to reduce the number of executive agencies to at least one. The simplification should be accompanied by a clarification of the functions that the new agency wants, its structure that should reflect a minimization of the decision-making bureaucracy and a description of the competences in such a way that it does not allow duplication, ambiguity or complexity of unmanageable in the decision-making circuit. The establishment of the new body should be done in such a way that its relationship with MESTI is clear, and does not allow space for ambiguity in its accountability line. Simplification should also be reflected in the relevant law that would have to codify the matter of vocational education and training as a whole in terms of the substantive side of regulation but also that of institutional management. The new agency will inherit the civil servants, strategic documents and the general framework of the institutional memory of its predecessors, AVETA and KAA. Also, according to the legal framework, currently within the system we also have supporting bodies, such as CAVETA, the Steering Council of KAA as well as the Steering Council of AVETA, whose members represent almost the same institutions and social partners. The new law will also provide for a clear separation of the executive role from the policy-making role, and the latter would remain the competence of the relevant MESTI department. The agency will be assigned functions, powers and responsibilities for vocational education and training, including: implementation of VET policies, validation and accreditation of programs and accreditation of vocational education and training IVETs in the sense of VETAE, the regulation of national qualifications including the population of the NQF and the implementation of strategies in the field of education and professional training, the advancement of education and professional training and quality assurance. Also, the agency deals with the professional development of teachers, the support and strengthening of IVETs (planning of programs, financing, human resources, international projects), the development of curricula, the strengthening and promotion of dual learning modalities, for learning at the workplace, internships in companies, professional internships, etc., the implementation of IVETs evaluations, etc. The empowerment of the agency will be done through legal mechanisms. MESTI/DVET are policy-making institutions for drafting primary and secondary legislation, drafting strategies, international cooperation, etc. Through the new law, the establishment of an independent body will be foreseen, which reflects the representation of the three parties relevant to VET, namely industries, students and public authority, and which will be vested with the competence to accredit VET educational institutions, validate programs and approve quality control and performance reports of these stakeholders. The merger of the three mechanisms into a single body should be done in accordance with the *acquis* principles. One of the fundamental principles of the *acquis* in the field of pre-university and vocational education and training and that of adults is the independence of the body that exercises the competence of accreditation of IVETs, validation of VET programs. Such a standard is also guaranteed by the Law on the NQF currently regarding the way the KAA operates. Therefore, in the Law will be foreseen that the agency will contain a collective decision-making body with the characteristics of KAA, which will be appointed in a public competition process and which will guarantee high professional standards, and which will enjoy full decision-making independence in terms of merit decisions for the accreditation of IVETs, validation of VET programs. Its decisions will be deeply based on the strategic determinations of vocational education and training, and should also be related to the needs of industries and the labor market. The independence of such a body will be ensured through the impossibility of dismissing its members, except for reasons related to serious violations of the law. The supplement-amendment of the three laws will result in a clear provision of a mechanism that more substantively links the institution and the VET program with the needs

**Commented [KB47]:** This is continuously being reiterated, but nowhere is it being argued.

**Commented [KB48]:** This doesn't stand, MESTI doesn't have such obligations. It has been a recommendation for the rationalization of agencies at the government level, by no means an obligation.

**Commented [KB49]:** Which should be provided by this concept document?

**Commented [KB50]:** Above, it was stated that the Ministry will only have a function in drafting legislation, of a legislative nature, implying that sub-legal acts remain the responsibility of the new Agency.

**Commented [KB51]:** So, Centers of Competence will not be managed further by the Agency. This would be very harmful for the Centers of Competences after all the investment throughout years.

**Commented [KB52]:** Which legal mechanisms will empower the agency, can a brief general overview be provided?

**Commented [KB53]:** So, students will also be represented in accreditation at the level of providers and qualifications? Are there such practices?

**Commented [KB54]:** Above all, they should be based on professional criteria/standards defined by law. Decisions are based solely on criteria. The criteria may reflect the strategic determinations of VET, which are continuously dynamic.

of the labor market, thus giving a functional dimension to such linkage. In addition, the revision of the three laws will result in a simplified institutional map, since the Steering Council of KAA and the Council for Vocational Education and Training and for Adult will be merged into a single body. The advisory character of this new body for MESTI will be redefined, placing it in the center that represents the three stakeholders for the definition of plans in the field of VET. Its decisions will be deeply based on the strategic determinations of vocational education and training, and should also be related to the needs of industries and the labor market. In the current laws in force, but also in the strategic documents, the connection of vocational education and training programs has not reached the goal. There is no functional mechanism that makes such a correlation according to the criteria necessary for reliable assessment. The new law will provide a functional mechanism that enables the correlation of qualifications with the needs of the market/industries. Such a mechanism should provide for periodic re-evaluation of IVET programs in order to assess whether they serve the needs of the market and industries, almost fully reflecting the evaluations of market operators. Based on such a system, curriculum reform would be automatically initiated in any case where a serious lack of productivity of graduates is found as a result of the lack of skills and knowledge acquired in the vocational educational and training process. Such an accountability circuit should be provided for in the new law, so as to officially make the industry associations, business associations, etc., co-shareholders in the process of accreditation, reform and financing of IVETs. The creation of a supervisory mechanism should result in changes in the governance of the agency, IVETs, etc.

**Commented [KB55]:** What have the current laws in force hindered in this direction?

Within this option, the stipulations of the Program for the Prevention and Reduction of Administrative Burden 2022-2027 will be fulfilled, in such a way as to digitize as much as possible the procedures envisaged in relation to licensing, validation and in general the system of vocational education and training. Also, the three laws will be harmonized with the Law on General Administrative Procedure (LGAP), especially in terms of the special administrative procedures of these laws against the LGAP, articles: 12, 73.3, 86.3, 98 and 135, in cases where it is relevant. The three draft laws will take into account all components related to the implementation of policies and good practices in the field of innovation, digitization, entrepreneurship and the green agenda.

Therefore, the recommended option for MESTI is option 3, since only it has the capacity to address the objectives fully and comprehensively.

**Chapter 4: Identification and assessment of future impacts**

**Option no. 1**

*Figure 6: The most significant impacts identified for the impact category*

<b>Main expected impacts</b>	
Budgetary impacts	The implementation of the concept paper under this option would not have negative budgetary impacts, however it would continue to finance a governance system of vocational education and training that is not efficient enough to spend public money.
Economic impacts	The implementation of the concept document according to this option would not have a positive impact on the country's economy. It will enable a better connection of vocational education and training with the needs of the labor market and the manufacturing and service industries in Kosova.
Social impacts	The implementation of the concept document according to this option is not expected to have any negative social impact.
Impacts on fundamental rights	The concept document under this option will not have any negative impact on fundamental rights.

Environmental impacts	The concept document under this option will not have any negative environmental impact.
Intersectoral impacts	The concept document according to this option would not increase the convergence of education policy with that of promoting and increasing competitiveness in the labor market, and the specialization of the manufacturing and service industries in the Kosova market.
Administrative charges for companies	The concept document under this option would not result in any new administrative burden.
The SME test	The concept document under this option would not result on having any negative impact in the SME test.

### Option no. 2

*Image 7: The most significant impacts identified for the impact category*

<b>Main expected impacts</b>	
Budgetary impacts	The implementation of the concept document under this option is not expected to have any additional budgetary impact on the current situation.
Economic impacts	The implementation of the concept document under this option would have a minimum positive impact on the country's economy. It will enable a better connection of vocational education and training with the needs of the labor market and the manufacturing and service industries in Kosova.
Social impacts	The implementation of the concept document according to this option is not expected to have any negative social impact. On the contrary, the concept document helps the policy of full employment, increasing the employability of social categories that lack qualifications, etc.
Impacts on fundamental rights	The concept document under this option will not have any negative impact on fundamental rights. It, on the other hand, will help in the more effective fulfillment of the positive obligations of the state in relation to the right to education of individuals.
Environmental impacts	The concept document under this option will not have any negative environmental impact.
Intersectoral impacts	The concept document under this option will increase the convergence of education policy with that of promoting and increasing competitiveness in the labor market, and the specialization of the manufacturing and service industries in the Kosova market.
Administrative charges for companies	The concept document under this option would not result in any new administrative burden.
The SME test	The concept document does not result on having any negative impact in the SME test.

### Option no. 3

*Image 8: The most significant impacts identified for the impact category*

<b>Main expected impacts</b>	
------------------------------	--

Budgetary impacts	The implementation of the policy is expected to have a budgetary impact; the fixed expenses for keeping two agencies in one will be reduced. Also, the administrative burden that has a relatively high fixed cost will be reduced.
Economic impacts	The implementation of the policy will have a positive impact on the country's economy. It will enable a better connection of vocational education and training with the needs of the labor market and the manufacturing and service industries in Kosova. An increase in harmonization between the two will increase the efficiency of public money, increase the productivity of the local economy and its education system in general. Also, the merging of the agencies will contribute to complementing the services of both previous institutions into a single one, a factor which will affect the development of the workforce.
Social impacts	The implementation of the concept document according to this option is not expected to have any negative social impact. On the contrary, the concept document helps the policy of employment, increasing the employability of social categories that lack qualifications, etc.
Impacts on fundamental rights	The concept document under this option will not have any negative impact on fundamental rights. It, on the other hand, will help in the more effective fulfillment of the positive obligations of the state in relation to the right to education of individuals.
Environmental impacts	The concept document under this option will not have any negative environmental impact.
Intersectoral impacts	The concept document under this option will increase the convergence of education policy with that of promoting and increasing competitiveness in the labor market, and the specialization of the manufacturing and service industries in the Kosova market.
Administrative charges for companies	The concept document under this option will not result in any new administrative burden, on the contrary, it aims to alleviate the excessive burdens that are produced due to bureaucratic procedures and the complexity of the institutional mechanism.
The SME test	The concept document under this option would not result on having any negative impact in the SME test.

**Commented [KB56]:** Which fixed expenses will be reduced? Also, which administrative burden will decrease and how?

**Commented [KB57]:** I don't believe that merging NQA and AVETAE will have any impact on workforce development.

#### Chapter 4.1: Challenges with data collection

Gathering data for the drafting of this concept document has been a difficult process. An initial challenge is the harmonization of data collected by municipalities; each of the municipalities has its own data system, which are often non-uniform. Another challenge appears in the data related to the labor market; there is a serious lack of data showing the productivity of teaching and learning in the field of vocational education and training. This is primarily the result of the lack of structured information on employers, on specific industries and on industry associations. Another challenge remains the data quality, due to the lack of surveys that measure the satisfaction of VET beneficiaries in the sense of very specific data.

#### Chapter 5: Communication and Consultation

*Image 9: Summary of communication and consultation activities carried out for a concept document*

The consultation process aims:						
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Obtaining the opinion of market stakeholders and final beneficiaries of VET for this reform</li> <li>- Review of public support for this reform</li> <li>- Consideration of the remarks of civil society stakeholders about this reform</li> </ul>						
Main purpose	Aimed group	Activity	communication/notification	Indicative deadline	Necessary budget	Person/institution in charge
Opened meeting will all stakeholders	All stakeholders	Public meetings	MESTI	April 2024	n/a	Department of Vocational Education and Training
Public consultation on writing	All stakeholders	Publication of the consultation on the portal for public consultation	MESTI	March 2024	n/a	The Government of the Republic of Kosova, OPM&MESTI
Consultation with interested donors	All donor agencies in Kosova	Consultation through a public conference	MESTI	April 2024	n/a	MESTI

## Chapter 6: Comparing the options

In order to address the solution of the problems identified in this document, three concrete options have been proposed that foresee different modalities. In this part, the options are compared with each other in order to identify the advantages and disadvantages of each option.

The first proposed option, which envisages maintaining the current situation (status quo) and does not ensure the elimination of the problems and causes identified by this concept document. Without a harmonization of specific laws, there will still be contradictory provisions between laws within a sector, and thus the legal framework will not be harmonized with the conventions and recommendations of the ONP, nor with the EU directives in this field. Moreover, the new policies envisaged by the Ministry such as that of NS and GR will not be fully initiated as no such legal changes will be made. Due to this situation, many of the issues and consequences presented above are not expected to change.

The second proposed option examines the possibility of improving the situation by changing the main framework of the strategic documents through the supplement-amendment of the strategic documents of the field of vocational education and training and the NQF. This option has a potential to improve to some extent the implementation of the existing law, however, it does not essentially address the reform of the institutional structure of vocational education and training and the NQF, provided for in Chapter 2 ('objectives').

The third option includes updating the legal framework (and updating the accompanying sub-legal acts) covering all areas of the sector. The supplement-amendment of the three laws and accompanying acts are expected to address all the objectives provided in this concept document. With the advancement of the legal framework, the legal and sub-legal acts within the sector and the relevant sectors will be harmonized to ensure the synchronization of the implementation of the legislation and their harmonization with the acquis. Further, updating the legal framework would align it with the conventions and recommendations of the

**Commented [KB58]:** Can you provide at least 2-3 examples where we have contradictory provisions between laws within the VET sector?

ONP and with the relevant EU Directive including the Youth Guarantee scheme as well as good practices from countries in the region and beyond. The third option would also create coherence with the key policies of the ministry and would improve the conditions for a clearer definition of roles within governing institutions, inter-institutional interaction that contribute to holistic and not fragmented governance. All these bring high potential in improving the quality of vocational education and training and the closest and constructive connection with the labor market.

The third option directly addresses all the problems and consequences identified by this concept document and therefore makes the recommendation logical to the Government of the Republic of Kosova to approve it as the most adequate option.

Image 10. The comparison table with all three options

Naming	Option 1.	Option 2.	Option 3.
Approach to actuality	Saving the current context	Partial change of the current context	Substantial change of the current context
Type of the intervention	Only at the internal organizational level	At the level of strategic documents of vocational education and training and pre-university education in general	At the level of three laws, based on three phases, with the first phase as an emergency intervention in the law on VET, and the entire infrastructure of sub-legal acts.
The form of addressing the reform	Through MESTI	Through MESTI, Government and parliamentary approval	Through MESTI, Government and parliamentary approval
Impact on the institutional structure	Minimal	Medium	Maximal

#### Chapter 6.1: Implementation plans for the various options

Image 11: Implementation plans for Option 1

The purpose of policy	The reform of the governance of vocational education and training in Kosova	Expected cost cypher
Strategic objective	Harmonization of vocational education and training to the labor market demands	
	Products, activities, year and responsible organization/department	

Specific objectives 1, 2 and 3 "Restructuring of central institutions in the field of education and professional training"; "Empowering the new agency with a full range of powers in the executive, administrative, regulatory in the field of vocational education and training of the NQF", and, 'Harmonization of laws in the field of vocational education and training in one legal act'	Product 1.1								
	Implementation of current laws		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Responsible institution/department	0
		Activity 1.1.1	Establishment of the working group for implementation	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0
		Activity 1.1.2	Implementation of the working group recommendations	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0
		Activity 1.1.3	M&E to recommendations	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0
	Product 1.2								
	Full implementation of existing AIs		Year 1	/	/	/	/	Responsible institution/department	0
Activity 1.2.1		Inclusion of the donor agencies voice	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0	



Specific objectives 4, 5 and 6  "Creation of independent mechanisms with responsibility for accreditation and licensing of IVETs and IVETA within the new agency"; 'The provision of a mechanism that links vocational education and training programs with the needs of the market', and, 'Creation of an accountable circuit in the field of vocational education and training'.	Product 2.1  Restructuring the new agency	Activity 2.1.1	Establishment of the working group on the legislation implementation	/	/	/	/	MESTI&A VETA	0
	Product 2.2  Selection of a civil servants range, who are competent and able to implement the reform in practice	Activity 2.1.2	Designing and opening the public competition for the recruitment of new employees	/	/	/	/	MESTI&A VETA	0

Image 12: Implementation plans for Option 2

The purpose of policy	The reform of the governance of vocational education and training in Kosova	Expected cost figure
Strategic objective	Harmonization of vocational education and training to the labor market demands	
	Products, activities, year and responsible organization/department	

Specific objectives 1, 2 and 3 "Restructuring of central institutions in the field of education and professional training"; "Empowering the new agency with a full range of powers in the executive, administrative, regulatory in the field of vocational education and training of the NQF", and, 'Harmonization of laws in the field of vocational education and training in one legal act'	Product 1.1									
	Review of current AIs		Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Responsible institution/department	0	
		Activity 1.1 1	Establishment of the working group	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0	
		Activity 1.1 2	Drafting new strategic documents	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0	
	Activity 1.1 3	Validation of new strategic documents with stakeholders	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0		
	Product 1.2									
	Amendment of current AIs		Year 1	/	/	/	/	Responsible institution/department	0	
		Activity 1.2 1	Inclusion of the donor agencies voice	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0	
	Specific objectives 4, 5 and 6  "Creation of independent mechanisms with responsibility	Product 2.1	Activity 2.1 1	Establishment of the working group for restructuring	/	/	/	/	MESTI&AVETA	0

for accreditation and licensing of IVETs and IVETA within the new agency"; 'The provision of a mechanism that links vocational education and training programs with the needs of the market', and, 'Creation of an accountable circuit in the field of vocational education and training'.	Product 2.2 Selection of a civil servants range, who are competent and able to implement the reform in practice	Activity 2.12	Designing and opening the public competition for the recruitment of new employees	/	/	/	/	MESTI&A VETA	0
--	--	---------------	---	---	---	---	---	-----------------	---

Image 13: Implementation plans for Option 3

The purpose of policy	The reform of the governance of vocational education and training in Kosova								Expected cost figure
Strategic objective	Harmonization of vocational education and training to the labor market demands								
	Products, activities, year and responsible organization/department								
Specific objectives 1, 2 and 3 "Restructuring of central institutions in the field of education and	Product 1.1								
	Drafting the new law on VET	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Responsible institution/department	0	
	Activity 1.11	Establishment of the workin	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0	

professional training"; "Empowering the new agency with a full range of powers in the executive, administrative, regulatory in the field of vocational education and training of the NQF", and, 'Harmonization of laws in the field of vocational education and training in one legal act'			g group						
		Activity 1.1 2	Drafting the new law/adoption	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0
		Activity 1.1 3	Validation of new law with stakeholders	/	/	/	/	MESTI	0
	Product 1.2								
	Adoption of the new law on VET for adults and the NQF	Year 1	Year 2	The establishment of the working group for the law on VET for Adults and the Law on the NQF	/	/		Responsible institution/department	0
	Activity 1.2 1		Inclusion of the donor agencies voice	Drafting the new laws on VET for adults and the NQF	/	/		MESTI	0
Specific objectives 4, 5 and 6  "Creation of independent mechanisms	Product 2.1  Restructuring the new agency	Activity 2.1 1	Establishment of the working group for	/	/	/	/	MESTI&AVETA	0

**Commented [KB59]:** Both of these activities have financial costs; drafting the law requires a number of staff and meetings, as well as consulting the law with stakeholders. Moreover, engaging international experts to support this process incurs a cost. I suggest that the ministry coordinate and obtain information from donors who will support these activities and reflect the costs supported here.

with responsibility for accreditation and licensing of IVETs and IVETA within the new agency"; 'The provision of a mechanism that links vocational education and training programs with the needs of the market', and, 'Creation of an accountable circuit in the field of vocational education and training'.	Product 2.2	Activity 2.1 2	restructuring Designing and opening the public competition for the recruitment of new employees	/	/	/	/	MESTI&A VETA	0
	Selection of a civil servants range, who are competent and able to implement the reform in practice								

**Commented [KB60]:** The agency cannot be empowered without hiring the necessary staff to carry out the new mandate and functions.

Image 14: Comparing the options

Consultation method:			
Relevant positive impacts	Option 1: No change	Option 2: Improvement of implementation and execution	Option 3: Updating the laws in the field of VET and NQF, and their sub-legal acts
	There is no substantial impact	There is a positive limited impact	There is a positive substantial impact
	The connection quality between the labor market and the VET is not improved	The connection quality between the labor market and the VET is improved minimally	The connection quality between the labor market and the VET is improved seriously
	There is no increase in governance convergence in the field of VET	The governance convergence in the field of VET is minimally increased	The governance convergence in the field of VET is seriously increased

<b>Negative relevant impacts</b>									
	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact	There is no anticipated negative impact
<b>Relevant costs</b>									
	There are no additional cost	There is minimal reduction in actual costs	There is minimal reduction in actual costs	There is minimal reduction in actual costs	There is minimal reduction in actual costs	There is minimal reduction in actual costs	There is substantial cost reduction in the field of VET	There is substantial cost reduction in the field of VET	There is substantial cost reduction in the field of VET
<b>Assessment of the expected budget impact</b>	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3
	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
<b>Conclusion</b>	Option that is not recommended			Option that is not recommended			Recommended option		

**Commented [KB61]:** This is not making sense, how will there be a substantial reduction in costs in the field of VET?

#### Chapter 7: Conclusions and future steps

According to all the analyzes made in this concept document, the only option that guarantees addressing the problems identified in the field of VET is the drafting of a new law, as well as the drafting of sub-legal acts in accordance with the new law. The main reasons that have led us to identify the main problem are the problems created by outdated legal provisions, as well as the need to update the legal basis in the field of employment and harmonization with other applicable laws in Kosova, as well as the Conventions of the Organization International Labor Organization and the EU directive on private employment agencies.

**Commented [KB62]:** Analyses should be referenced then?

The plan for the implementation of this Concept Document, provided it is approved with the recommended option, it is as follows:

**Commented [KB63]:** It is being said that there are outdated legal provisions; bear in mind that the Law on VET is from 2013. Nowhere in the document was an analysis of the current Law on VET, its shortcomings offered.

**Table 8: Implementation plans of the recommended option**

Public consultations for the concept document – xx/xx/2024
Approval of the concept document in the Government - xx/xx/2024
Establishment of the working group for the drafting of the new law - xx/xx/2024
Drafting the new law on VET- xx/xx/2024
Approval of the new draft law on VET in the government - xx/xx/2024
Updating/adoption of the new law on VET for adults and the NQF 2025/2026
Adoption of the new draft law on VET for adults and the D\draft law on NQF in the government) 2025/2026

#### Chapter 7.1: Provisions for monitoring and evaluation

The implementation of the concept document will be evaluated in terms of achieving the objectives through its monitoring by the Department of Policy Coordination in MESTI. The same will be reported to the minister on a regular weekly basis.

Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

Appendix 1: Economic impact evaluation form

The impacts economic category	Key impact	Is this impact expected to occur?		Number of organizations, companies and/or individuals affected	Expected benefit or impact cost	Preferred level of analysis
		Yes	No			
Workplaces <sup>3</sup>	Will the current number of workplaces increase?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the current number of workplaces reduce?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it affect the payment level?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it affect the ease of finding a job?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Making business	Will it affect access to business finance?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will certain products be withdrawn from the market?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will certain products be allowed in the market?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will businesses be forced to close?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will new businesses be created?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Administrative workload	Will businesses be forced to fulfill the obligations of providing new information?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Have the obligations of providing information for businesses been simplified?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Trade	Are current import flows expected to change?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are current export flows expected to change?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Transport	Will there be an effect on the way passengers and/or goods are transported?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will there be any difference in the time required to transport passengers and/or goods?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses

**Commented [KB64]:** Then how will the new agency of VET be empowered with new functions and mandates, if new human resources capacities are not provided?

<sup>3</sup> When it affects workplaces, there will also be social impacts.



Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

Investments	Are companies expected to invest in new activities?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are companies expected to cancel or postpone investments?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will investments from the diaspora increase?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will investments from the diaspora decrease?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will direct foreign investments increase?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will direct foreign investments decrease?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Competitiveness	Will the price of business products, such as electricity, increase?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the price of business inputs, such as electricity, decrease?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are innovation and research likely to be promoted?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is innovation and research likely to be hindered?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Impact on SMEs	Are the affected companies mainly SMEs?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Prices and competitiveness	Will the number of goods and services available to business or consumers increase?			Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the number of goods and services available to business or consumers decrease?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the prices of existing goods and services increase?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the prices of existing goods and services decrease?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Economic regional impacts	Will any particular business sector be affected?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is this sector concentrated in a certain region?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Economic overall development	Will future economic growth be affected?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Could it have any effect on the inflation rate?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses

Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

Appendix 2: Assessment form for social impact

The social impacts category	Key impact	Is this impact expected to occur?		Number of organizations, companies and/or individuals affected	Expected benefit or impact cost	Preferred level of analysis
		Yes	No			
Workplaces <sup>4</sup>	Will the current number of workplaces increase?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the current number of workplaces reduce?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are workplaces in a particular business sector affected?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have any effect on the payment level?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on the ease of finding a job?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Economic regional impacts	Are social impacts concentrated in a particular region or city?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Workplace conditions	Are workers' rights affected?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are standards for working in hazardous conditions provided or repealed?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on the way of developing the social dialogue between employees and employers?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Social inclusion	Will it have impact on poverty?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is access to social protection schemes affected?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the price of basic goods and services change?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on the financing or organization of social protection schemes?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Education	Will it have an impact on primary education?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on secondary education?	X		High	High	Descriptive analyses

**Commented [KB65]:** Then how will the new agency of VET be empowered with new functions and mandates, if new human resources capacities are not provided?

<sup>4</sup> When it affects workplaces, there will be also economic impacts.

Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

	Will it have an impact on higher education?	X		High	High	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on vocational education?	X		High	High	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on workers education and lifelong learning?	X		High	High	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on the organization or structure of the education system?	X		High	High	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on academic freedom and self-government?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Culture	Does the option affect cultural diversity?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the funding of cultural organizations?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect opportunities for people to benefit from or participate in cultural activities?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect in preserving cultural heritage?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Governance	Does the option affect citizens' abilities to participate in the democratic process?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is each person treated equally?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will the public be better informed about certain issues?	X		Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the way political parties work?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have any effect on the civil society?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Public health and safety <sup>5</sup>	Will it have any effect on people's lives, such as life expectancy or mortality rates?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it have an impact on higher education?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will health risk increase or decrease due to harmful substances?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will there be health effects due to changes in noise levels or air, water and/or soil quality?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses

<sup>5</sup> When there is an impact on public health and safety, then there are regularly environmental impacts.

Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

	Will there be health effects due to changes in energy use?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will there be health effects due to changes in the waste disposal?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will there be an impact on people's lifestyles, such as levels of interest in sport, changes in nutrition, or changes in tobacco or alcohol use?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are there particular groups that face much higher risks than others (defined by factors such as age, gender, disability, social group or region)?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Crime and safety	Does it affect the probability that criminals will be caught?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is potential profit affected by crime?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Will it affect the corruption levels?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is law enforcement capacity affected?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does it have any effect on the rights and safety of crime victims?		X	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses

Appendix 3: Environmental impacts evaluation form

The environmental impacts category	Key impact	Is this impact expected to occur?		Number of organizations, companies and/or individuals affected	Expected benefit or impact cost	Preferred level of analysis
		Yes	No			
Sustainable climate and environment	Will it have an impact on the emission of greenhouse gases (carbon dioxide, methane, etc.)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will fuel consumption be affected?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will the variety of resources change, that are used for energy production?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will there be any price difference for environmentally friendly products?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will certain activities become less polluting?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Air quality	Will it have an impact on emission of air pollutants?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Water quality	Does the option affect freshwater quality?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Does the option affect in groundwater quality?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Does the option affect drinking water resources?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Soil quality and land use	Will there be an impact on soil quality (regarding acidification, pollution, use of pesticides or herbicides)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will it have an impact on soil erosion?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will land be lost (through construction, etc.)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will land be earned (through decontamination, etc.)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will there be any change in land use (ex. from forest use to agricultural or urban use)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Waste and recycling	Will the amount of waste generated change?		No	Low	Low	n/a

Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosovo

	Will the ways in which waste is handled change?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will there be an impact on opportunities for waste recycling?		No	Low	Low	n/a
The use of resources	Does the option affect the use of renewable resources (fish stocks, hydro-power, solar energy, etc.)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Does the option affect the use of non-renewable resources (groundwater, minerals, coal, etc.)?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Environmental risks degree	Will there be any effect on the probability of risks, such as fires, explosions or accidents?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will it affect preparedness in case of natural disasters?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Is the protection of society affected by natural disasters?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Biodiversity, flora and fauna	Will there be an impact on protected or endangered species or the areas where they live?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will the size or connections between nature areas be affected?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will it have any effect on the number of species in a certain area?		No	Low	Low	n/a
Animals wellbeing	Will animals treatment be affected?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will animals health be affected?		No	Low	Low	n/a
	Will the quality and safety of animals feed be affected?		No	Low	Low	n/a

Appendix 4: Fundamental rights impact evaluation form

The category of fundamental rights impact	Key impact	Is this impact expected to occur?		Number of organizations, companies and/or individuals affected	Expected benefit or impact cost	Preferred level of analysis
		Yes	No			
Dignity	Does the option affect people's dignity, their right to life or a person's integrity?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Freedom	Does the option affect the individuals right?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect a person's right to privacy?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the right to marry or create a family?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the legal, economic or social protection of individuals or families?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect freedom of thought, conscience or religion?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the freedom of expression?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the freedom of assembly or association?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Personal data	Does the option include the processing of personal data?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are the individual's rights of access, correction and objection guaranteed?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is the way in which personal data is processed clear and well protected?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Asylum	Does this option affect the right to asylum?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Property rights	Will property rights be affected?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the freedom to do business?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses



Concept document for the field of governance and management of vocational education and training in the Republic of Kosova

Equal treatment <sup>6</sup>	Does the option protect the principle of equality before the law?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Are there chances that certain groups likely to be harmed directly or indirectly by discrimination (eg any discrimination based on sex, race, colour, ethnicity, political or other opinion, age or sexual orientation)?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Does the option affect the rights of persons with disabilities?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
The children's right	Does the option affect children's rights?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
Good administration	Will administrative procedures become more complicated?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is the way in which the administration makes decisions affected (transparency, procedural deadline, right of access to a file, etc.)?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	On criminal law and the prescribed punishments: are the rights of the defendant affected?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses
	Is access to justice affected?		No	Low	Low	Descriptive analyses

<sup>6</sup> Gender equality is treated in the Gender Impact Assessment

**Page 23: [1] Commented [KB29]**

**Kushtrim Bajrami**

**5/16/2024 2:18:00 PM**

The current VET agency manages centers of competences. This is also the Croatian model of the VET agency. However, in this case, an agency that manages CoCs cannot also be responsible for accreditation, namely external quality assurance. If the VET agency decides to deal with accreditation, then CoCs cannot be further under its management. I don't think this would be the right thing to do and it would be very harmful for quality assurance in VET and for CoCs. In most VET systems in the region, CoCs are managed by the agency, while external quality assurance is carried out by separate independent institutions.

**Page 23: [2] Commented [KB32]**

**Kushtrim Bajrami**

**5/16/2024 2:19:00 PM**

I don't think that holds. This concept document is not claiming that there will be only one law for the entire field of VET. Of course, laws for national qualifications, laws for pre-university education, laws for adult education, etc., will remain to cover segments of the VET field.

**Page 23: [3] Commented [KB34]**

**Kushtrim Bajrami**

**5/16/2024 2:20:00 PM**

The current agency for VET includes the management of Centers of Competence (CoCs). However, in this case, an agency managing CoCs cannot also be responsible for accreditation, namely external quality assurance. If the VET agency decides to engage in accreditation, then Competence Centers cannot remain under its management. I don't think this would be the right move.